M.R.O. 1—77,006—8 6-37.

(1) Number of pages ____________

(2) Date of repair ____________

(3) Initials of the Referencer ____________

MADRAS RECORD OFFICE.

Government of Madras.

Public works DEPARTMENT.

G.O. No. 401, 402	2492	Press / Mis.
Dated	22-10-	1872.

Not to be folded or roughly handled

No. 401. Read the following letter from the Superintending Engineer, 8th Division, to the Secretary to Government, Public Works Department, dated Madura, 23rd September 1872, No. 2,824 :—

I HAVE the honour to forward herewith, for the favourable consideration of His Excellency the Governor in Council, the accompanying letter, No. 357, dated 16th instant, from Executive Engineer Captain Pennycuick, R.E., calling attention to certain points which appear to him to have been overlooked in G. O., No. 2,043, dated 27th August; and received in this office on the 5th instant.

1 Copy of letter.

2. The "Perryaur allowances" were granted as explained in G. O., 10th August 1870, No. 1,905, to enable officers "to meet the additional expenses to which they were necessarily put when within the Hill tracts," and "to provide for the heavy expense of living and the difficulty of travelling on the Perryaur Hills". And it was further ruled in that G. O. that "Periacolum, at the mouth of the Cumbum Valley, should be considered the boundary in that direction of the 'Hill tracts.'"

3. It is logically clear therefore, as pointed out by Captain Pennycuick, that an officer at work in these "Hill tracts" is entitled to the allowances authorized in the G. O. above quoted, whether the Government may designate the work on which he is employed as "Provincial" or "Imperial Extraordinary." And I trust, therefore, that the Government will be pleased to authorize the Controller to pass the special allowances in question to Captain Pennycuick when employed on the Hill tracts above specified.

4. I would also invite the attention of His Excellency the Governor in Council to the fact that in G. O., 4th July 1872, No. 1,618, special funds are allotted from Loan Funds for personal allowances and the temporary establishment necessary for road-tracing work in connection with the Perryaur project. It would thus appear that for the comparatively easy work of making this trace the Executive Officer is entitled to extra allowances, which he is not authorized to claim in the same Hill tracts for the more difficult and laborious work connected with the Goodaloor Ghaut, because the Ghaut work is termed a "Provincial service," whereas the road-tracing is classed as an "Extraordinary Imperial service." I feel satisfied that I have only to point out so anomalous a state of affairs to the Government to ensure their issuing the necessary instructions to have the matter arranged on a proper basis.

From Captain J. PENNYCUICK, R. E., Executive Engineer in charge of Dindigul Range, to the Superintending Engineer, 8th Division, dated Dindigul, 16th September 1872, No. 357.

IN acknowledging the receipt of G. O. No. 2,043 of the 27th ultimo, forwarded with your memorandum No. 2,626 of 10th instant, I have the honour to ask attention to one or two points which appear to have been overlooked by Government.

2. I think it would not be difficult to show that, as regards the amount of labour (I do not say as regards professional skill) required for its proper supervision, this

range is beyond comparison the most troublesome in the Presidency, and the addition of the survey and trace, and eventually I hope of the execution of the Goodalore Ghaut situated as it is in the very furthest corner of the range at a distance of eighty miles from my head-quarters, necessarily involves a considerable increase to this labour.

3. I do not in the least overlook the fact that the Goodalore Ghaut has no connection with the Perryaur project; it would be difficult to do so after the correspondence that has lately passed upon this subject, but that does not make its supervision in the least less troublesome, nor does the fact of Lieutenant Greer's presence on the spot, valuable as his assistance unquestionably is, entirely destroy, though it certainly reduces, either my labour or my responsibility in the matter.

4. Admitting, however, that a Range Officer's capacity for work and liability to perform it are infinite, and that no addition to his labours gives a claim to additional remuneration, I think I am at least entitled to the "Perryaur allowances" when actually employed on the ghaut and its neighbourhood.

5. These allowances were originally given, *and very rightly*, to the officers employed in the Perryaur investigations, not on account of the importance of the work, *but on account of the fatiguing nature of it*, and of the expense involved in living in a jungle at a distance from any inhabited country, where every article of food had to be carried by highly-paid coolies.

6. I have recently spent some days in Lieutenant Greer's company, with the object of fixing a line for the Goodalore Ghaut, and I did not find that the hill sides along which we had to walk, or rather crawl, were one whit less steep, nor that the rain to which we were exposed wetted us the less, nor that the coolies who carried up our food, clothing and furniture, charged any the less or carried any the more, because the work on which we were employed was to be paid for from "Provincial" funds, instead of from "Imperial, Extraordinary."

7. Seeing then that the causes on account of which the extra Perryaur allowances were granted are not in any way affected by the separation of the Goodalore Ghaut from the Perryaur project, and that not only do these causes affect me as much as any one else, but that when working on and above the ghaut I have to keep up my regular travelling equipage, in addition to the special arrangements required on the hills, I think I am reasonably entitled to claim while so employed the additional allowances that have always been granted to the officers working in these tracts.

8. Should you concur in this view, I request that you will be so good as to forward this letter to Government for consideration.

No. 402. ORDER THEREON, 22nd October 1872, No. 2,492.

ESTABLISHMENT, No. 34.

IN his letter printed with G. O. No. 2,043 of 27th August, Lieutenant-Colonel Roberts represented on behalf of Captain Pennycuick that the "regular work of the Dindigul Range occupied quite as much of his time as the Government could well claim from a Range

Officer; and that the additional work thrown upon him by the supervision of the proceedings in connection with the Perryaur project could only be done by an amount of labour much beyond what an officer under ordinary circumstances could reasonably be expected to undergo."

2. Under these circumstances Captain Pennycuick asked what additional remuneration the Government proposed to allow him on its account. No specific claim was made, or previous orders granting special allowances alluded to.

3. The order passed by His Excellency the Governor in Council pointed out that the work in question had no connection with the Perryaur project, and did not call for the additional amount of labour which was the only plea put forward in support of Captain Pennycuick's indefinite claim.

4. In the papers now submitted a definite claim is made by Captain Pennycuick for the Perryaur allowances sanctioned in G. O. No. 1,905 of 10th August 1870. His Excellency the Governor in Council is not of opinion that a valid claim to the Perryaur allowance of Rupees 150 a month can be sustained by Captain Pennycuick. But he is pleased to permit Captain Pennycuick to draw the double travelling allowance, hitherto passed to officers connected with the Perryaur project works, whenever duties connected with the Goodaloor Ghaut take him west of Cumbum; up to which point at least his ordinary range work must call him.

5. The Governor in Council must express his disapprobation of the objectionable tone of Captain Pennycuick's representations; and he desires Lieutenant-Colonel Roberts in future to exercise fully the duties of his position, and not to submit to Government any letter so improperly drawn up as that under review.

(True Extract.)

Colonel, R.E.,
Secretary to Government.

To the Superintending Engineer, 8th Division.
,, Controller of Public Works Accounts.

Exd. S. T. Austin.

Executive Engineer's Office
No. 357. Dindigul 16th September 1872.

From,

The Executive Engineer in charge
Dindigul Range.

To

The Superintending Engineer 8th Dn.
Madura.—

Sir,

In acknowledging the receipt of O. G. No. 2043 of the 27th ultimo, forwarded with your Memo No. 2626 of 10th Instant, I have the honor to ask attention to one or two points which appear to have been overlooked by Government.—

2. I think it would not be difficult to show that as regards the amount of labor (I do not say as regards professional skill) required for its proper supervision, this range is beyond comparison the most troublesome in the Presidency and the addition of the survey and trace, and eventually I hope of the execution of the Goodalore Ghaut, situated

as

as it is in the very furthest corner of the Range, at a distance of eighty miles from my head quarters necessarily in:volves a considerable increase to this labor.—

2. I do not in the least, overlook the fact that the Goodalore Ghaut has no connection with the Periaur Project- it would be difficult to do so after the correspondence that has lately passed upon this Subject- but that does not make its supervision in the least less troublesome, nor does the fact of Lt Greer's presence on the spot, valuable as his assistance unquestionably is, entirely destroy, though it certainly reduces, either my labor or my responsibility in the matter.—

4. Admitting however that a Range Officer's capacity for work and liabi:lity to perform it are infinite, and that

no addition to his labors gives a claim to additional remuneration, I think I am, at least entitled to the "Periaur allowances" when actually employed on the Ghaut and its neighbourhood.—

5. These allowances were originally given, and very rightly, to the Officers employed in the Periaur investigations, not on account of the importance of the work but on account of the fatiguing nature of it, and of the expense involved in living in a jungle at a distance from any inhabited country, where every article of food had to be carried by highly paid coolies.—

6. I have recently spent some days in Lieutenant Greer's company, with the object of fixing a line for the Goodalore Ghaut and I did not find that the hill sides along which we had to walk, or

rather

rather crawl, were one whit less steep, nor that the rain to which we were exposed wetted us the less, nor that the coolies who carried up our food, clothing and furniture, charged any the less or carried any the more, because the work on which we were employed was to be paid for from "Provincial" funds, instead of from "Imperial Extraordinary."—

7. Seeing then that the causes on account of which the extra Periaur allowances were granted, are not in any way affected by the separation of the Goodalore Ghaut from the Periaur Project, and that not only do these causes affect me as much as any one else, but that when working on and above the Ghaut I have to keep up my regular travelling equipage, in addition to the special arrangements required on the

hills

hills, I think I am reasonably en-
:titled to claim while so employed, the
additional allowances that have always
been granted to the Officers working in
these tracts.—

8. Should you concur in this
view I request that you will be so
good as to forward this letter to
Government for consideration.—

I have &ca

(Signed) John Pennycuick Captn. RE
Executive Engineer in
charge, Dindigul Range

(True Copy)

Richd. A. Roberts Lieut. Colonel RE
Superintg. Engineer 8th Dn.

Compd
[illegible]

Enclosure No. 1.

In a letter from the Supt. Engineer 8th Dn. No. 2824 dated 23d Sept. 1872,

To

The Secretary to Govt.
P.W.D.
Madras.

P.W. 4873/72.

Copy of letter No. 357, dated 16th Sept. 1872, from Executive Engineer Captain Pennycuick R.E.

Pros: 22d October/72 No. 13 No. 411.

No. 2824

Superint. Engineer's Office 8th Dn.
Madura 23rd September 1872

From,

Lieut. Colonel R. A. Roberts R.E.
Superint. Engineer 8th Dn.

To,

Colonel G. W. Walker R.E.
Secretary to Government PWD.
Madras.

Sir,

I have the honor to forward herewith for the favorable consideration of His Excellency the Governor in Council, the accompanying letter No. 357, dated 16th Instant from Executive Engineer Captain Pennycuick R.E. calling attention to certain points which appear to him to have been overlooked in G.O. No. 2,043, dated 27th August and received in this Office on the 5th Instant.

Enclosure: 1 Copy of Letter

2. The "Perryaur allowances" were granted as explained in G.O. 10th August 1870,

1870, No. 1905, to enable Officers "to meet the "additional expenses to which they were "necessarily put when within the Hill "Tracts" and "to provide for the heavy expense "of living and the difficulty of travelling "on the Perryaur Hills". And it was further ruled in that G. O. that "Periacolum, "at the mouth of the Cumbum Valley "should be considered the boundary in that direction of the "Hill Tracts"."

3. It is logically clear therefore, as pointed out by Captain Pennycuick, that an Officer at work in these "Hill Tracts" is entitled to the allowances authorized in the G. O. above quoted whether the Government may designate the work on which he is employed as "Provincial" or "Imperial extraordinary". And I trust therefore that the Government

will

will be pleased to authorize the Controller to pass the special allowances in question to Captain Pennycuick when employed on the Hill Tracts above specified.—

4. I would also invite the attention of His Excellency the Governor in Council to the fact that in G. O. 4th July 1872, No 1618, special Funds are allotted from Loan-Funds, for personal allowances, and the temporary Establishment necessary, for road-tracing work in connection with the Perryaur Project. It would thus appear that for the comparatively easy work of making this trace, the Executive Officer is entitled to extra-allowances, which he is not authorized to claim in the same Hill Tracts for the more difficult and laborious work connected with the Goodaloor Ghaut,

because

This Trace cannot be [illegible] till Loan Funds are sanctioned for the Project
[illegible]

because the Ghaut Work is termed a "Provincial Service", whereas the road-tracing is classed as an "Extra-ordinary Imperial Service". I feel satisfied that I have only to point out so anamalous a state of affairs to the Government to ensure their issuing the necessary instructions to have the matter arranged on a proper basis.—

I have the honor to be,

Sir,

Your Most Obedt. Servt.

Richd. A. Roberts Lieut. Coll. R.E.

Superintending Engineer 8th Dn.

Compd
[illegible]

W

P. W. 1872 Depart:
Pro: of Govt for October
No. 2824.
No. 4673.

From, The Supt. Engineer
8th Dn.

To The Secretary to Govt. P.W.D.
Madras

Dated 23rd } September 1872.
Received 26 }

Enclo: 1.

Forwards a copy of Captn. Pennycuick's letter, claiming for extra allowance for the Supervision of the Goodaloor Ghaut Works & requests that the same be sanctioned.

No. 2492 22 Octr./72.

No. 401
Recd. 26-9-72. ch.
Desptd. to Coll. 26 Septr./72

Memo. by the Chief Engineer

In his letter printed with G. O. No. 2043 of 27th August Lieutenant Colonel Roberts re-presented on behalf of Captain Pennycuick that the "regular work "of the Dindigal Range "occupied quite as much of his time "as the Government "could well claim "from a Range Officer; "and that the additional

Captn Pennycuick's claim which in itself seems to be just, should have been submitted in more respectful terms. There is a vein of sarcasm running through his letter which is very objectionable.

H.

My remarks in the former application have not been put up. As

Now put up — [illegible]

"work thrown upon him
"by the supervision
"of the proceedings in
"connection with the
"Perryaur project could
"only be done by an amount
"of labour much beyond
"what an Officer under
"ordinary circumstances
"could reasonably be
"expected to undergo".

Under these cir-
-cumstances Captain
Pennycuik asked,
(not to be relieved
of the additional
work alluded to, but)
what additional re-
-muneration the
Govt. proposed to allow

it appears that
we have a R. E.
Officer specially
engaged on the
trace. I do not
see that Capt
Pennycuick can
claim a special
allowance for
looking after him
because he is
at one end of
his range. I have
no objection however
to his drawing a
special extra rate
of travelling allow
ance when his
duties take him

him on its account.
No specific claim was
made, or previous
orders granting spe-
-cial allowances
alluded to.

The order passed
by His Excellency the
Governor in Council
pointed out that the
work in question
had no connection
with the Perryar
project, and did
not call for the ad-
-ditional amount
of labour which was
the only plea put
forward in support

to that part of the country - [illegible] the precedent [illegible] of [illegible] Ex[illegible] the [illegible]. To the "Perryar allowance" no claim seems admissible.

I consider the tone of [illegible] letter [illegible] ~~[illegible]~~ [illegible] should be pointed out to him.

[illegible] to the Hon. the Gov. [illegible]

L. O. S.

of Captain Pennycuick's indefinite claim.

In the papers now submitted for orders a definite claim is made by Captain Pennycuick for the "Perryaur Allowances" sanctioned in G.O. No. 1905 of 10th August 1870. But as responsible for discipline not only in the Department of Public Works, but in the body of Royal Engineer Officers serving in the Madras Presidency, Col. Walker must take exception

I cannot say that if, (as I understand to be the case) not Capt. Pennycuick but Lieut. Greer is charged more immediately with the "execution" of the Shoodaloor Ghaut, Capt Pennycuick has any valid claim to extra remuneration. The G.O. of 10th May 1870 commits the Govt. to the grant of certain allowances in connection with the Perryaur Project, and one reason which it gives for such a grant is that the work is work "in the hill-tracts"; but the

to the unbecoming tone in which not only the present but the former application was couched — And he takes leave to point out that the Supt Engineer, a Lieutenant Colonel of Royal Engineers, might have been expected to check the impropriety of tone now taken exception to, instead of encouraging it as he has done by the tone of his own remarks

does not follow that extra allowances are inadmissible to be given for work, of whatever degree of importance, in the same hill-tracts. There seems no reason to doubt the correctness of the opinion which we have already given that the work of the Range is not more than a Range Officer can be expected to perform, when the services of an able assistant have been placed at his disposal for the special purpose in question —

He might nevertheless have been

238

Captain Pennycuick as Dindigal Range Officer draws already an allowance for carriage of Office Records allowed to no other Officer in the Presidency up to this date. His other Range work takes him at times at least as far up the Valley as Cumbum; and the Chief Engineer considers that his claim will be amply met by granting him Perryaur allowances for the days spent west of Cumbum on work connected with the new Goodaloor Ghaut.

Gun...

see G.O. No 948 of 5th Oct 1866

inclined to stretch a point in Capt Pennycuick's favor, but for the tone of his letter now under consid^n, which Col. Roberts ^ should not [?] have been forwarded.

[initials]

I would grant Captain Pennycuick Perryaur allowances when employed west of Cumbum and work connected with the new Goodaloor Ghaut as suggested by the Chief Engineer, and would censure him for the improper tone of his letter &

Lt Col Roberts for... [illegible] ...

A. J.

[illegible]
[illegible]
[illegible]
[illegible]
[illegible]
[illegible]

His Excellency the
Governor in Council will
take into Consideration
Captn Pennyenicks' claims
when submitted in a more
becoming manner.

GMW.

Captn Pennycu

H.E. the Com. in Ch

Mrs. J. D. [illegible]

Public Works Department

No. 2492

Proceedings of the Madras Government

Read the following

From The Supt Engineer 8th Division } H.E. No. 2824d/23rd Septr 72

In his letter printed with G.O. No. 2043 of 27th August Lieutenant Colonel Roberts repre-sented on behalf of Captain Pennycuick that the "regular work "of the Dindigal Range "occupied quite as much "of his time as the Govt. "could well claim from "a Range officer; and that "the additional work

"thrown upon him by the
"supervision of the pro-
-"ceedings in connection
"with the Perryaur project
"could only be done
"by an amount of la-
-"bour much beyond
"what an Officer under
"ordinary circumstances
"could reasonably be
expected to undergo".

Under these cir-
-cumstances Captain
Pennycuick asked,
(not to be relieved of
the additional work
alluded to, but) what
additional remunera-
-tion the Government

Better [illegible] [illegible] [illegible] ask [illegible]!

proposed to allow him on its account - No specific claim was made, or previous orders granting special allowances alluded to.

The order passed by His Excellency the Governor in Council pointed out that the work in question had no connection with the Perryaur project, and did not call for the additional amount of labour which was the only plea put forward in support of Captain

Pennycuick's indefinite claim.

In the papers now submitted a definite claim is made by Captain Pennycuick for the Perryaur allowances sanctioned in G. O. No. 1905 of 10th August 1870. His Excellency the Governor in Council is not of opinion that a valid claim to the Perryaur allowance of Rs 150 a month can be sustained by (any Officer but Lieutenant Greer, who is in actual

Insert say - "Capt Pennycuick" -

charge of the Goodaloor Ghaut works. But he is pleased to permit Captain Pennycuick to draw the double Travelling allowance, hitherto passed to officers connected with the Perryaur Project works, whenever duties connected with the Goodaloor Ghaut take him west of Cumbum up to which point at least his ordinary Range work must call him.

The Governor in Council must express

his (strong) disapproba-
-tion of the objectionable
tone of Capt. Pennycuick's
representations; (which
alone is calculated
to prejudice his claim
to the consideration
of Govt.) and he
desires Lieutenant
Col. Roberts in
future to exercise
(full) one of the duties of
his position, and not
to submit to Govt.
any letter so im-
-properly drawn up
as that under review.

Gov.

32/3

To the Supg. Engr. /
" Controller /

Desp. 28/10/72

Honble J. D. [illegible]
[illegible]
[illegible]

[illegible]

9-73 - cle

No. 4073

Govt. of {1872} Madras.

PUBLIC WORKS.

To The Superintending Engr.
8th Division

Dated

Recd.   Encl. 1.

G. O. 22nd Octr. No. 2492.

Nos. 401 & 402

Capt. Pennycuick's claim

to the Perryaur allowances on account of the supervision of the Goodalore Ghaut, declined; & permission granted to that Officer to draw double travelling allowance.